



Racial Equity Analysis for Significant Board Items

Board Item Date	9/17/2024
Board Item Name	Update on County Services for Immigrant Communities
Department/Agency (Lead)	CAO
<i>If this is an inter-departmental initiative, please identify a lead above.</i>	
Person(s) Completing Analysis	Maggie Luce

1. Overview: Describe your program or policy and the desired results and outcomes?

- What is the program or policy decision under consideration?
- What are the desired results (in the **community**) and outcomes (within your own organization)?
- What does this proposal have an ability to impact?

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Children and youth	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Health
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Community engagement	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Housing
<input type="checkbox"/> Contracting equity	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Human services
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Criminal justice	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Jobs
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Economic development	<input type="checkbox"/> Parks and recreation
<input type="checkbox"/> Education	<input type="checkbox"/> Planning / development
<input type="checkbox"/> Environment	<input type="checkbox"/> Transportation
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Food access and affordability	<input type="checkbox"/> Utilities
<input type="checkbox"/> Government practices	<input type="checkbox"/> Workforce equity
<input type="checkbox"/> Other _____	

Staff recommend that the County of Sonoma Board of Supervisors accepts an update on staff efforts to understand what County services are currently available for immigrant communities. This Board item is the first update in a phased approach to better understanding service access for immigrant communities. The intended result of the broader work effort is to assist County departments and local service providers in providing more up-to-date information and referrals, avoid duplication of services, and create a stronger and more connected network of care for immigrant community members. Potential outcomes within the County may include increased information sharing and data collection practices to support decision-making processes related to services for immigrant communities.

2. Data: What's the data? What does the data tell us?

- Will the proposal have impacts in specific geographic areas (neighborhoods, areas, or regions)? What are the racial demographics of those living in the area?

Racial Equity Analysis for Significant Board Items

- b. What does population level data, including quantitative and qualitative data, tell you about existing racial inequities? What does it tell you about root causes or factors influencing racial inequities?
- c. What performance level data do you have available for your proposal? This should include data associated with existing programs or policies.
- d. Are there data gaps? What additional data would be helpful in analyzing the proposal? If so, how can you obtain better data?

A: No new policy is being proposed in this Board item, and no specific funding recommendations are included. Therefore, this proposal/Board item will not have a specific impact on geographic areas. The scope of this broader work effort includes immigrant communities throughout Sonoma County and is not limited to a specific geographic area. With a population of [489,000, Sonoma County is 58% White, 29% Latino, 5% Asian/Pacific Islander, and 2% Black.](#)

B: According to the [2021 ACS 5-Year Estimates](#), Sonoma County has a higher percentage of foreign-born residents than neighboring Mendocino and Lake counties. [The Portrait of Sonoma County: 2021](#) estimates that 73,000, or 15% of Sonoma County's 489,000 residents as of the 2020 Census, were born outside of the United States. Of Sonoma County's total immigrant population, nearly two-thirds, or 66%, are from Latin America and more than half from Mexico. The Portrait also cites the [Migration Policy Institute's](#) estimate that 29,000 undocumented immigrants reside in the county, 87% of whom are from Mexico or Central America.

The County of Sonoma is linguistically diverse with almost 12 percent of residents 5 and older, or 54,847 people, speaking a language other than English at home, according to the [2020 U.S. Census](#). More than 40,000 of these individuals speak Spanish, comprising almost 10 percent of the county's population. Overall, more than 75 other languages are spoken by residents. The [Portrait of Sonoma](#) presents Human Development Index (HDI) data, which is a composite measure of well-being and access to opportunity made up of health, education, and earnings indicators. While the Portrait of Sonoma does not include data metrics disaggregated by immigration status, it does include data disaggregated by race and ethnicity. The 2021 update of the Portrait of Sonoma reveals that the County's overall Human Development Index (HDI) score, comprised of health, education and earnings measures, is 6.19 out of a maximum total score of 10.00. The HDI score for the four largest racial/ethnic groups respectively are as follows: White 6.74, Latino 4.93, Asian 6.86, and Black 3.99. Multiple factors, including access/affordability of housing, immigration status, racial discrimination, employment stability and wages, language barriers, access to health care, and access to education, can be attributed to the differences in these scores. Additionally, the County has experienced and continues to be impacted by multiple, devastating disasters, including the 2017 firestorm, Kincade, Walbridge and Glass fires, the 2019 flood, and the Covid pandemic.

Data related to the racial inequities specifically within the City of Santa Rosa is included in the [City of Santa Rosa's 2016 Community Safety Scorecard](#). According to this Scorecard report, when the demographic make-up data of Santa Rosa is overlayed with indicators of safety and

Racial Equity Analysis for Significant Board Items

well-being, the data indicates that the City's Latino population is concentrated in neighborhoods with higher incidences of crime, poverty, gang activity and lower educational attainment. One root cause that may contribute to Latino populations disproportionately living in these neighborhoods is a history of systematic removal, discrimination, and exclusion, which removed non-white individuals and communities from owning and/or renting property, or confined their residency to only certain areas of the County.

Here are some additional data points related to inequities that are specific to immigrant communities:

- According to National Organization for Women's [2015 Intimate Partner Violence, Undocumented & Immigrant Women report](#) immigrant women are at particular risk of victimization since immigrant women experience abuse at rates almost three times the national average.
- According to American Progress's [2020 article on Protecting Undocumented Workers on the Pandemic's front lines](#), among those Americans bearing the brunt of the pandemic and its economic fallout are 10.4 million undocumented immigrants.
- Per the 2018 Bureau of Labor Statistics, there are approximately 11,000 vineyard workers in Sonoma County. [Urban Institute's 2017 Latinx Immigrant Crime Victims Fear Seeking Help](#) article states, Latinx Immigrants in low-wage jobs are at risk of labor violations and physical and sexual abuse. The article suggests that Latinx immigrant victims may avoid reporting crimes against them and seeking services because they fear deportation. It is difficult for the County to document the full extent of this type of victimization because the District Attorney staff and law enforcement do not ask about a person's immigration status and immigrants report crimes at lower rates.
- In 2023, the Economic Development Collaborative gathered data from partner organizations, which included questions about barriers to accessing business services. Specific barriers most frequently named by immigrant residents included language, technology, and lack of trust in government services.
- Qualitative data collected by the Office of Equity to inform the development of the County's Community Engagement toolkit (approved by the [Board on June 10, 2024](#)), revealed that Immigrant communities found the translation of County documents to often be confusing in terminology.

C: There County has limited data on existing programs and policies related to immigrant communities.

D: Most County Departments do not currently collect data on the immigration status of clients served through County programs. The primary barrier to collecting this data is due to concerns about privacy and data sensitivity, particularly in relationship to citizenship status and risks of deportation. Another data collection challenge is related to limited staffing capacity to collect and analyze disaggregated data specific to all the subcategories of immigrant communities.

Racial Equity Analysis for Significant Board Items

There are some models within the County that could be replicated and/or expanded to increase data collection and analysis capacity. For example, for the American Rescue Plan Act (ARPA) Community Resilience Programs, the County adopted Anti-Racist Results Based Accountability (AR-RBA) to support meaningful programmatic monitoring and reporting. This data collection process measures success at the population (community) level through Results and Indicators and at the program level through Performance Measure. Another example of the County expanding capacity for data collection and decision making, which may include questions related to immigration status, is the development of the County's Universal Disaster Intake Process. This process includes options to consider demographic data for eligibility assessment for disaster emergency financial assistance to individuals that may be available during declared emergencies.

It would be helpful to have additional data on the geographic distribution of immigrants in Sonoma County, as well as data on immigrants in Industry and Occupation categories. Staff recommend researching whether any community groups are already collecting this type of data and determining whether this type of data could be incorporated into County departments' existing data collection efforts.

Two upcoming opportunities to obtain better data to inform program and policy recommendations specific to immigrant communities include:

1. University of California Berkeley's survey on Working in Wildfires: Protecting the Health, Safety, Economic Security, and Data Privacy of Agricultural Workers During Wildfire Evacuations. UC Berkeley will publish the findings and recommendations after October 2024.
2. The Economic Development Collaborative, County Administrator's Office, Office of Equity, and Secure Families Collaborative will collect local immigrant services data as part of a project to create an asset map and gap analysis. This work, which is funded by the California Governor's Office of Business and Economic Development's Local Immigrant Integration and Inclusion Grant, will begin in October 2024 and be completed by September 2025. The deliverable will be a comprehensive map of Sonoma County's economic development and social service providers, focusing on immigrant communities. The finished asset map will assist County departments, area nonprofits, and service providers in providing more up-to-date information and referrals, avoid duplication of services, and create a stronger and more connected network of care for immigrant community members.

The County may also want to consider creating a report on data related to the demographic and economic contributions of immigrants in the County. The [Gateway for Growth](#) Challenge research and technical assistance grant opportunity could be one way to fund the development of this type of report. This report could include immigrant community data such as population by age/gender/race/ethnicity, amount of time lived in the County, origin countries, spending power and tax contributions, workforce demographics, etc.

Racial Equity Analysis for Significant Board Items

3. Community Engagement: How have communities been engaged? Are there opportunities to expand engagement?

- a. Who are the most affected community members who are concerned with or have experience related to this proposal? How have you involved these community members in the development of this proposal?
- b. What has your engagement process told you about the burdens or benefits for different groups?
- c. What has your engagement process told you about the factors that produce or perpetuate racial inequity related to this proposal?

A: Immigrant community members and organizations that provide direct services to these communities are most impacted by policies and decisions made related to services for immigrant communities. This Board update primarily looks internally to determine what data is currently available on the services provided to immigrant communities through County services and/or the County's contracts with community-based organizations. Staff initiated conversations with a few stakeholder organizations in preparation for this Board update including Secure Families Collaborative, Sonoma Immigrant Services, COAD, 2-1-1. Community Organizations Active in Disaster, and United Way/2-1-1.

The next phase of this work effort will include a robust community engagement component. Through a grant from the California Governor's Office of Business and Economic Development, the County will work with Secure Families Collaborative to create an asset map and gap analysis. County Secure Families Collaborative (SFC) is a 501(c)3 nonprofit organization established by Sonoma County's Board of Supervisors to meet the needs of the immigrant community. SFC serves as a backbone organization to the USF School of Law Immigration and Deportation Defense Clinic, Immigration Institute of the Bay Area (IIBA), Catholic Charities of the Diocese of Santa Rosa, Sonoma Immigrant Services, Santa Rosa Legal Aid, and the Queer Asylum Accompaniment, who together offer legal services and connections to social and cultural services. Through the asset map project, SFC will lead the development of the resource inventory and will identify gaps and needs to better connect immigrant populations with county resources.

B: The engagement process for the asset map project will not begin until after October 2024. Initial conversations with a limited group of stakeholders indicated some key concerns related to immigrant communities. Specific concerns/burdens that we have heard from stakeholders include Language Justice, Disaster Pay, and cooperation with the U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement agency (ICE). One group that has spoken to the Board during public comment at Board meetings is a coalition of Sonoma County community members and organizations, who are united in support of immigrants and their rights. Some of the organizations represented in this coalition include Raizes Collective, ALMAS Libres, North Bay Organizing Project, North Bay

Racial Equity Analysis for Significant Board Items

Rapid Response Network, Immigration Defense Task Force, Sonoma Immigrant Services, North Bay Jobs with Justice, HPEACE, Immigration Legal Resource Center, Corazón Healdsburg, and Padilla Partners. This coalition has specifically raised concerns about the collaboration and historical cooperation between the Sheriff's Office and ICE, indicating that it creates fear for immigrant community members.

C: The engagement process for the asset map project will not begin until after October 2024.

4. Analysis and Strategies: What are your strategies for advancing racial equity?

- a. Given what you have learned from research and stakeholder involvement, how will the proposal increase or decrease racial equity? Who would benefit from or be burdened by your proposal?
- b. What are potential unintended consequences? What are the ways in which your proposal could be modified to enhance positive impacts or reduce negative impacts?
- c. Are there complementary strategies that you can implement? What are ways in which existing partnerships could be strengthened to maximize impact in the community? How will you partner with stakeholders for long-term positive change?
- d. Are the impacts aligned with your community outcomes defined in Step #1?

A: This Board item does not have a specific proposal for any policy changes.

B: This Board item does not have a specific proposal for any policy changes.

C: Complimentary strategies to improve services to immigrant communities include implementation of the County's language access policy and community engagement toolkit. As part of the language access policy, the County will bolster efforts to provide timely interpretation and translation services to County residents and visitors in their preferred language. The County's community engagement toolkit provides recommendations on culturally sensitive community engagement practices to be implemented by County Departments. Additionally, the Board approved a plan in June 2024 to increase participation in County boards and commissions for underserved communities of color, and communities who have not traditionally had access to join these governing bodies.

D: This Board item does not have a specific proposal for any policy changes. Staff will look to the Board for direction on potential work efforts to increase the County and the public's awareness of the services and gaps in services available for immigrant communities. Depending on Board direction, staff would revisit the equity analysis to assess potential racial equity impacts.

5. Implementation: What is your plan for implementation?

Describe your plan for implementation:

N/A – This Board item is an update with no new proposed policy to implement.

Racial Equity Analysis for Significant Board Items

Is this implementation plan:	Yes	No	I'm Not Sure
Realistic?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Adequately funded?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Adequately resourced with personnel?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Adequately resources with mechanisms to ensure successful implementation and enforcement?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Adequately resourced to ensure on-going data collection, public reporting, and community engagement?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

If the answer to any of these questions is no, what resources or actions are needed?

Realistic? N/A – no proposed change

Adequately funded? Funding is secured for the asset map and gap analysis. Additional funding may be needed should the Board direct staff to bring back recommendations or policies related to services for immigrant communities.

Adequately resourced with personnel? N/A – no proposed change

Adequately resources with mechanisms to ensure successful implementation and enforcement? N/A – no proposed change

Adequately resourced to ensure on-going data collection, public reporting, and community engagement? If the Board wanted to change data collection practices or recommend more analysis or policy changes, this could impact the funding needs.

6. Accountability and Communication: How will you ensure accountability, communicate, and evaluate results?

- How will impacts be documented and evaluated? Are you achieving the anticipated outcomes? Are you having impact in the community?
- What are your messages and communication strategies that will help advance racial equity?
- How will you continue to partner and deepen relationships with communities to make sure your work to advance racial equity is working and sustainable for the long-haul?

N/A – no proposed policy change. Pending Board direction on whether further analysis and/or evaluation is desired.